

1 ROBINS, KAPLAN, MILLER & CIRESI L.L.P.
 Roman M. Silberfeld, Bar No. 62783
 2 RMSilberfeld@rkmc.com
 David Martinez, Bar No. 193183
 3 DMartinez@rkmc.com
 Jill S. Casselman, Bar No. 266085
 4 JSCasselmann@rkmc.com
 Vincent S. Loh, Bar No. 238410
 5 VSLoh@rkmc.com
 2049 Century Park East, Suite 3400
 6 Los Angeles, CA 90067-3208
 Telephone: 310-552-0130
 7 Facsimile: 310-229-5800

8 ROBINS, KAPLAN, MILLER & CIRESI L.L.P.
 Elliot S. Kaplan, Bar No. 53624
 9 ESKaplan@rkmc.com
 K. Craig Wildfang (*Pro Hac Vice*)
 10 KCWildfang@rkmc.com
 Laura E. Nelson, Bar No. 231856
 11 LENelson@rkmc.com
 800 LaSalle Avenue
 12 2800 LaSalle Plaza
 Minneapolis, MN 55402
 13 Telephone: 612-349-8500
 Facsimile: 612-339-4181

14 Attorneys for Plaintiffs
 15 BEST BUY CO., INC.; BEST BUY
 PURCHASING LLC; BEST BUY ENTERPRISE
 16 SERVICES, INC.; BEST BUY STORES, L.P.;
 BESTBUY.COM, L.L.C.; and MAGNOLIA HI-FI,
 17 INC.

18 UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT
 19 NORTHERN DISTRICT OF CALIFORNIA
 20 SAN FRANCISCO DIVISION

21
 22 IN RE: CATHODE RAY TUBE (CRT)
 ANTITRUST LITIGATION

Master Case No.: 3:07-cv-05944-SC
 MDL No. 1917

23
 24 This document relates to:

25 *Electrograph Systems, Inc. et al. v.*
Technicolor SA, et al., No. 13-cv-05724;

26 *Alfred H. Siegel, as Trustee of the Circuit City*
Stores, Inc. Liquidating Trust v. Technicolor
 27 *SA, et al., No. 13-cv-05261;*

**DECLARATION OF VINCENT S. LOH
 IN SUPPORT OF DIRECT ACTION
 PLAINTIFFS' OPPOSITION TO
 THOMSON SA'S MOTION TO
 DISMISS**

Date: March 7, 2014
 Time: 10:00 a.m.
 Before the Honorable Samuel Conti

1 *Best Buy Co., Inc., et al. v. Technicolor SA, et*
2 *al., No. 13-cv-05264;*
3 *Interbond Corporation of America v.*
4 *Technicolor SA, et al., No. 13-cv-05727;*
5 *Office Depot, Inc. v. Technicolor SA, et al., No.*
6 *13-cv-05726;*
7 *Costco Wholesale Corporation v. Technicolor*
8 *SA, et al., No. 13-cv-05723;*
9 *P.C. Richard & Son Long Island Corporation,*
10 *et al. v. Technicolor SA, et al., No. 13-cv-*
11 *05725;*
12 *Schultze Agency Services, LLC, o/b/o Tweeter*
13 *Opco, LLC, et al. v. Technicolor SA, Ltd., et*
14 *al., No. 13-cv-05668;*
15 *Sears, Roebuck and Co. and Kmart Corp. v.*
16 *Technicolor SA, No. 3:13-cv-05262;*
17 *Target Corp. v. Technicolor SA, et al., No. 13-*
18 *cv-05686*

I, VINCENT S. LOH, declare as follows:

1. I am a duly licensed attorney admitted to practice in the State of California and before this Court. I am an attorney in the law firm of Robins, Kaplan, Miller & Ciresi L.L.P. in Los Angeles, California, counsel for Plaintiffs Best Buy Co., Inc., Best Buy Purchasing, LLC, Best Buy Enterprise Services, Inc., Best Buy Stores, L.P., Bestbuy.com and Magnolia Hi-Fi, LLC (collectively, "Best Buy") in this action. Each of the facts stated herein is true and correct within my personal knowledge, and if called as a witness, I would competently testify thereto.

2. I submit this declaration in support of the Direct Action Plaintiffs' ("DAPs")¹ Opposition to Thomson SA's Motion to Dismiss.

3. Attached hereto as Exhibit A is a true and correct copy of the original document and its certified translation, Bates Numbered SDCRT-0006632 and SDCRT-0006632E, produced by Samsung SDI on approximately June 18, 2010 with the custodian designation of K.C. Oh.

FILED UNDER SEAL.

4. Attached hereto as Exhibit B is a true and correct copy of excerpts from Samsung SDI's Supplemental Response to Direct Purchaser Plaintiffs' First Set of Interrogatories, Nos. 4 and 5 (Oct. 17, 2011). **FILED UNDER SEAL.**

5. Attached hereto as Exhibit C is a true and correct copy of a document, Bates Numbered TAEC-CRT-00116979, produced by Toshiba America Electronic Components, Inc. ("TAEC") on approximately Aug. 31, 2011 with the custodian designation of Sean Collins.

FILED UNDER SEAL.

6. Attached hereto as Exhibit D is a true and correct copy of a document, Bates Numbered SDCRT-0088604, produced by Samsung SDI on approximately Sept. 19, 2011 with the custodian designation of Samsung SDI. **FILED UNDER SEAL.**

¹ The Direct Action Plaintiffs include the following plaintiffs: Best Buy Co., Inc.; Best Buy Purchasing LLC; Best Buy Enterprise Services, Inc.; Best Buy Stores, L.P.; BestBuy.com, L.L.C.; Magnolia Hi-Fi, LLC; Electrograph Systems, Inc.; Electrograph Technologies, Corp.; Office Depot, Inc.; Interbond Corporation of America; P.C. Richard & Son Long Island Corporation; MARTA Cooperative of America, Inc.; ABC Appliance, Inc.; Shultze Agency Services, LLC; Alfred H. Siegel, solely in his capacity as Trustee of the Circuit City Stores, Inc. Liquidating Trust; Costco Wholesale Corporation; Sears Roebuck and Co. and Kmart Corp.; and Target Corp.

7. Attached hereto as Exhibit E is a true and correct copy of the original document and its certified translation, Bates Numbered MTPD-0426066 and MTPD-0426066E, produced by Panasonic Corporation on approximately Oct. 17, 2011 with the custodian designation of Koichi Nishiyama. **FILED UNDER SEAL.**

8. Attached hereto as Exhibit F is a true and correct copy of the original document and its certified translation, Bates Numbered SDCRT-0002526 and SDCRT-0002526E, produced by Samsung SDI on approximately Dec. 8, 2010. **FILED UNDER SEAL.**

9. Attached hereto as Exhibit G is a true and correct copy of the original document and its certified translation, Bates Numbered SDCRT-0002585 and SDCRT-0002585E, produced by Samsung SDI on approximately Dec. 8, 2010. **FILED UNDER SEAL.**

10. Attached hereto as Exhibit H is a true and correct copy of the original document and its translation, Bates Numbered CHU00030040 and CHU00030040E, produced by Chunghwa Picture Tubes, Ltd. on approximately March 8, 2010. **FILED UNDER SEAL.**

11. Attached hereto as Exhibit I is a true and correct copy of excerpts from THOMSON multimedia S.A.'s Annual Report (Form 20-F) (June 30, 1999).

12. Attached hereto as Exhibit J is a true and correct copy of excerpts from the Declaration of Frederic Rose, *In re Petition of Frederic Rose* (Dkt. No. 3, Case No. 09-17355 (Bankr. S.D.N.Y. Dec. 16, 2009)).

13. Attached hereto as Exhibit K is a true and correct copy of excerpts from THOMSON S.A.'s Annual Report (Form 20-F) (May 30, 2003).

14. Attached hereto as Exhibit L is a true and correct copy of excerpts from the Brief for Plaintiff-Appellant Thomson S.A. in *Thomson S.A. v. Quixote Corp.*, 166 F.3d 1172 (Fed. Cir. 1999).

15. Attached hereto as Exhibit M is a true and correct copy of *Digital Sales Lift Thomson SA*, Calgary Herald, Oct. 13, 2006 at D9.

16. Attached hereto as Exhibit N is a true and correct copy of excerpts from THOMSON multimedia S.A.'s Annual Report (Form 20-F) (Mar. 29, 2002).

///

17. Attached hereto as Exhibit O is a true and correct copy of a document, Bates
Numbered TAEC-CRT-00095077, produced by TAEC on approximately Aug. 31, 2011 with the
custodian designation of Sean Collins. **FILED UNDER SEAL.**

18. Attached hereto as Exhibit P is a true and correct copy of a document, Bates
Numbered TAEC-CRT-00090061, produced by TAEC on approximately Aug. 31, 2011 with the
custodian designation of Sean Collins. **FILED UNDER SEAL.**

19. Attached hereto as Exhibit Q is a true and correct copy of a document, Bates
Numbered TAEC-CRT-00095072, produced by TAEC on approximately Aug. 31, 2011 with the
custodian designation of Sean Collins. **FILED UNDER SEAL.**

20. Attached hereto as Exhibit R is a true and correct copy of a document, Bates
Numbered TAEC-CRT-00086226, produced by TAEC on approximately Aug. 31, 2011 with the
custodian designation of Sean Collins. **FILED UNDER SEAL.**

21. Attached hereto as Exhibit S is a true and correct copy of a document, Bates
Numbered TAEC-CRT-00094042, produced by TAEC on approximately Aug. 31, 2011 with the
custodian designation of Sean Collins. **FILED UNDER SEAL.**

22. Attached hereto as Exhibit T is a true and correct copy of a document, Bates
Numbered TAEC-CRT-00095092, produced by TAEC on approximately Aug. 31, 2011 with the
custodian designation of Sean Collins. **FILED UNDER SEAL.**

23. Attached hereto as Exhibit U is a true and correct copy of document, Bates
Numbered HEDUS- CRT00162777, produced by Hitachi Electronic Devices (USA), Inc.
("HEDUS") on approximately Dec. 16, 2011 with the custodian designation of Tom Heiser.
FILED UNDER SEAL.

24. Attached hereto as Exhibit V is a true and correct copy of *Thomson Cuts Earnings
Forecast; Demand for TVs Slows*, Tech Europe, June 25, 2003, at 301.

25. Attached hereto as Exhibit W is a true and correct copy of a document, Bates
Numbered TDA01360, produced by Technologies Displays Americas LLC on approximately
October 8, 2013 with the custodian designation of Technologies Displays Americas LLC.

///

1 26. Attached hereto as Exhibit X is a true and correct copy of excerpts from
2 THOMSON multimedia S.A.'s Annual Report (Form 20-F) (June 29, 2004).

3 27. Attached hereto as Exhibit Y is a true and correct copy of the docket obtained from
4 LexisNexis CourtLink on February 4, 2013 regarding *Thomson S.A. v. Time Warner, Inc., et al.*,
5 filed in the United States District Court, District of Delaware by Thomson S.A. on February 25,
6 1994.

7 28. Attached hereto as Exhibit Z is a true and correct copy of THOMSON multimedia
8 S.A.'s Statement of Beneficial Ownership (Form 13D/A) (Feb. 8, 2000).

9 Executed this 10th day of February 2014, at Los Angeles, California.

10
11
12 
13 Vincent S. Loh
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25
26
27
28